

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL

October 29, 2021

Via FOIA Xpress

Hans Bader Bader Family Foundation 1100 Connecticut Ave, N.W. Suite 625 Washington, D.C. 20036

Re: Bader Family Foundation v. U.S. Department of Education – October 2021 Release Civil Action No.: 1:21-cv-02086 (DLF) FOIA Request No.: 21-01695-F

Dear Mr. Bader:

This letter is the Department of Education's response to Bader Family Foundation's request, dated May 20, 2021, for information pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552. Specifically, FOIA Request No. 21-01695-F seeks:

Any email sent or received between February 1, 2021 and the date you process this request, by any covered Education Department employee that contains the following words: (1) "1619 Project," and (2) "history and civics"; and (3) "grant" and (4) "program" or "programs" and (4) "Gordon Wood" or "James McPherson" or "Sean Wilentz" or "Timothy Sandefur" or "Victoria Bynum."

The release of 1,338 pages has been uploaded to the FOIA Xpress System for your review. All responsive pages have been released to you.

However, certain information has been withheld according to FOIA exemptions 5 U.S.C. § 552 (b)(5) and (b)(6), specified below:

• Records or portions of records relating to certain intra-agency information is exempt from disclosure pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552 (b)(5) of the FOIA. This exemption permits the withholding of inter- or intra-agency information that could be withheld under civil discovery, including information subject to the deliberative process, attorney-client, or attorney-work product privileges.

400 MARYLAND AVE. S.W., WASHINGTON, DC 20202-1100 www.ed.gov

The Department of Education's mission is to promote student achievement and preparation for global competitiveness by fostering educational excellence and ensuring equal access.

Page 2 FOIA Request No. 21-01695-F

• Records or portions of records relating to personal information is exempt pursuant to 5 U.S.C. §552 (b)(6) of the FOIA. Disclosure of this information would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.

Because this request is in litigation, if you have questions regarding this response, please contact AUSA Stephanie Johnson at <u>Stephanie.Johnson5@usdoj.gov</u>.

Sincerely,

Kristin Delbridge General Attorney

cc: AUSA Stephanie Johnson

PLEASE REPLY TO:

 2207 RAYBURN HOUSE OFFICE BUILDING WASHINGTON, DC 20515 (202) 225–6165

 2424 Springer Drive Suite 201
 NORMAN, OK 73069 (405) 329–6500

711 SW D AVENUE
 SUITE 201
 LAWTON, OK 73501
 (580) 357–2131

 SUGG CLINIC OFFICE BUILDING 100 EAST 13TH STREET, SUITE 213 ADA, OK 74820 (580) 436–5375

TOM COLE 4TH DISTRICT, OKLAHOMA

The Diothicit, Okcanolia

DEPUTY WHIP

COMMITTEE ON RULES RANKING REPUBLICAN

COMMITTEE ON APPROPRIATIONS VICE RANKING REPUBLICAN

LABOR, HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, EDUCATION AND RELATED AGENCIES – RANKING REPUBLICAN DEFENSE



Congress of the United States House of Representatives

May 13, 2021

The Honorable Miguel Cardona, Ed.D. Secretary U.S. Department of Education 400 Maryland Ave SW Washington, DC 20202

\$1

Dear Secretary Cardona,

I write to urge you to withdraw the proposed priorities for the American History and Civics Education programs that were published in the Federal Register on April 19, 2021. It is clear from the content of the priorities, as well as the accompanying justification for their proposal, that they will do little more than erode bipartisan support for expanding civics education in the United States by promoting questionable, divisive, and politicized scholarship.

It is no secret that civics education in America is in crisis. Only a quarter of school children have demonstrated proficiency in civics according to the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP). Students scored even lower on the NAEP's history assessment.¹ Furthermore, a study by the Annenberg Public Policy Center determined that 75 percent of Americans could not accurately identify the three branches of government, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation found only 36 percent of Americans could pass the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services' naturalization test – a test that nearly 98 percent of immigrant test-takers pass.^{2,3}

For this reason, I partnered with colleagues in the House and Senate, representing both Republicans and Democrats, to introduce the Civics Secures Democracy Act, which would provide \$1 billion annually toward promoting civics education in elementary and secondary education.⁴ This bill represents bipartisan consensus regarding the need to address civics illiteracy and to educate America's youth on her founding principles, documents, and system of governance.

It is my commitment to civics education that leads me to oppose your department's proposed priorities. These priorities do nothing to ameliorate this pressing problem and threaten to upend bipartisan support for increasing investments in civics education. In the proposed priorities, your department lauds *The New York Times*' 1619 Project as an example of "teaching and learning that reflects the breadth and depth of our

- ³ "National Survey Finds Just 1 in 3 Americans Would Pass Citizenship Test." *The Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation*. https://woodrow.org/news/national-survey-finds-just-1-in-3-americans-would-pass-citizenship-test. Accessed 12 May 2021.
- ⁴ "Civics Secures Democracy Act of 2021." *Congress.gov.* https://www.congress.gov/bill/117th-congress/house-bill/1814?s=1&r=2. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹ "How Did U.S. Students Perform on the Most Recent Assessments?" *The Nation's Report Card*, https://www.nationsreportcard.gov. Accessed 12 May 2021.

² "Americans are Poorly Informed About Basic Constitutional Provisions." *Annenberg Public Policy Center*, https://www.annenbergpublicpolicycenter.org/americans-are-poorly-informed-about-basic-constitutional-provisions. Accessed 12 May 2021.

Nation's diverse history" and demands that grant applicants incorporate practices that highlight our "ongoing national reckoning with systemic racism." It also cites Ibram X. Kendi and his views on "anti-racism."

These references and statements are concerning for a number of reasons. As a former history professor, I certainly support offering diverse perspectives in education, and the goal of the 1619 Project to elevate oftmarginalized stories and individuals in American history is understandable. However, to cite this project as accurate historical analysis is to do damage to history education in American schools because of its welldocumented errors.

The 1619 Project was not developed by trained historians and has been the subject of criticism from leading members of academia concerning its credibility. Gordon Wood, Professor Emeritus of History at Brown University, has called the project "so wrong in so many ways."⁶ Wood and four other eminent historians authored a letter to the *Times* in December 2019, writing that the project's errors, "which concern major events, cannot be described as interpretation or 'framing.' They are matters of verifiable fact, which are the foundation of both honest scholarship and honest journalism. They suggest a displacement of historical understanding by ideology."⁷ Princeton University history professor Sean Wilentz, one of the signatories and an expert on the American Revolution, expounded on his concerns and further stated "no matter how the history is interpreted and related, [it] cannot be forwarded through falsehoods, distortions, and significant omissions."⁸ Unsparing in his criticism, Adolph Reed, Jr., Professor Emeritus of Political Science at the University of Pennsylvania, said the 1619 Project "reflects the agenda of the Democratic Party today."⁹

If you are not familiar with the "falsehoods, distortions, and significant omissions" of the 1619 Project, chief among them are its claims concerning the basis of the American Revolution. In the project's introductory essay, Nicole Hannah-Jones makes the claim that "one of the primary reasons the colonists decided to declare their independence from Britain was because they wanted to protect the institution of slavery."¹⁰ In reducing the American Revolution to little more than a slaveholders' rebellion, this project swats aside the weight of historical evidence and primary sources that run counter to this claim. This assertion disregards the leading role northern colonies took as pioneers of the abolition movement and the influence they had on the abolition of the slave trade, and slavery as a whole, worldwide, as well as the revolution "being a primary *disrupter* of slavery in the North American Colonies."^{11,12} While the 1619 Project argues it was antislavery sentiment in Great Britain, and the resulting colonial fears of impending abolition, that catalyzed the revolution, historical evidence – and indeed the timeline itself – reveals that an organized anti-slavery movement in America predated a comparative movement in Great Britain and, in fact, influenced abolitionism there.¹³

⁹ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with political scientist Adolph Reed, Jr. on the New York Times' 1619 Project." World Socialist Web Site. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/12/20/reed-d20.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹² Harris, Leslie M. "I Helped Fact-Check the 1619 Project. The Times Ignored Me." POLITICO.

⁵ Proposed Priorities—American History and Civics Education, 86 Fed. Reg. 20348 (April 19, 2021)

⁶ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian Gordon Wood on the New York Times' 1619 Project." *World Socialist Web Site*. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/11/28/wood-n28.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

⁷ "We Respond to the Historians Who Critiqued the 1619 Project." The New York Times Magazine.

https://www.nytimes.com/2019/12/20/magazine/we-respond-to-the-historians-who-critiqued-the-1619-project.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

⁸ Wilentz, Sean. "A Matter of Facts." *The Atlantic*. https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2020/01/1619-project-newyork-times-wilentz/605152. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹⁰ Hannah-Jones, Nicole. "Our democracy's founding ideals were false when they were written. Black Americans have fought to make them true." *The New York Times Magazine*.

https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/08/14/magazine/black-history-american-democracy.html. Accessed 12 May 2021. ¹¹ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian Gordon Wood on the New York Times' 1619 Project."

https://www.politico.com/news/magazine/2020/03/06/1619-project-new-york-times-mistake-122248. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹³ Wilentz, Sean. "A Matter of Facts."

Furthermore, the emphasis of the 1619 Project and your department on critical race theory and teaching students that America is irredeemably and systemically racist disregards the complex, differing viewpoints on slavery, race, and discrimination that have existed since our founding, as well as the significant progress America has made. The 1619 Project posits that "anti-black racism runs in the very DNA of this country."¹⁴ While America has worked haltingly throughout her history to extend equal rights and protection under the law to all her children, the notion that America is systemically racist glosses over other moments, individuals, and truths of our history. As Princeton University historian James McPherson explains:

The idea that racism is a permanent condition, well that's just not true. And it also doesn't account for the countervailing tendencies in American history as well. Because opposition to slavery, and opposition to racism, has also been an important theme in American history...From the Quakers in the 18th century, on through the abolitionists in the antebellum, to the radical Republicans in the Civil War and Reconstruction, to the NAACP which was an interracial organization founded in 1909, down through the Civil Rights movement in the 1950s and 1960s, there have been a lot of whites who have fought against slavery and racial discrimination, and against racism. Almost from the beginning of American history that's been true. And that's what's missing from this perspective.¹⁵

Historian James Oakes, Distinguished Professor of History and Graduate School Humanities Professor at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, further explains that such notions are:

not only ahistorical, they're actually anti-historical. The function of those tropes is to deny change over time...We're all in the same boat we were back then. And that's what original sin is. It's passed down. Every single generation is born with the same original sin. And the worst thing about it is that it leads to political paralysis. It's always been here. There's nothing we can do to get out of it. If it's the DNA, there's nothing you can do. What do you do? Alter your DNA?¹⁶

While furthering the idea that racism is an immutable characteristic of the nation, the department also paradoxically supports schools "working to incorporate anti-racist practices into teaching and learning," suggesting that systemic racism is something that can be overcome after all.¹⁷ Racism cannot be both unconquerable and vanquishable. As a tribal citizen, I support teaching and learning practices that instill respect for other races, ethnicities, and cultures. However, I have reservations as to what the department's understanding of "anti-racism" entails, and its relation to civics education, particularly because of its quotation of Ibram X. Kendi, who has written, "The only remedy to past discrimination is present discrimination. The only remedy to present discrimination is future discrimination."¹⁸ That the U.S. Department of Education would lend credence to the notion that the answer to historical injustices is to commit present and future ones is alarming.

For these reasons, I urge you to withdraw these proposed priorities. Civics education is meant to inform our nation's students on the principles and history of our founding and system of governance. It is meant to foster civic participation and to unite Americans of different races, faiths, and backgrounds around a set of common ideals, forging "out of many, one." In your appearance before the House Labor, Health and Human Services, Education, and Related Agencies Subcommittee, you endorsed this idea, sharing, "Yes, we have a

¹⁴ Hannah-Jones, Nicole. "Our democracy's founding ideals were false when they were written. Black Americans have fought to make them true."

¹⁵ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian James McPherson on the New York Times' 1619 Project." *World Socialist Web Site*. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/11/14/mcph-n14.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹⁶ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian James Oakes on the New York Times' 1619 Project." *World Socialist Web Site*. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/11/18/oake-n18.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹⁷ Proposed Priorities—American History and Civics Education, 86 Fed. Reg. 20349 (April 19, 2021)

¹⁸ Kendi, Ibram X. How to Be an Antiracist. Random House, 2019.

divided country, but our education system is going to unite us. Again, the goal here is to really build community."¹⁹

If the goal is unity and to build community, these proposed priorities will not achieve it. These priorities are deeply divisive, and the elevation of dubious historical scholarship suggests the importance of political narrative over historical fact in civics education. Moreover, the American people do not want federal mandates on the content of their children's education material. In our hearing, your answers on the topic were both contradictory and unclear, especially when you stated the department cannot mandate curriculum but then admitted it could issue certain priorities it wants grantees to include in their applications.²⁰ These answers are sharply at odds with one another.

While I disagree strongly with these priorities and ask for their withdrawal, I would like to extend the offer to work with you on a more bipartisan approach to civics education. Though these priorities are misguided as proposed, I appreciate the intent to incorporate diverse perspectives in history and civics education because I personally understand the importance of race in American history.

I am a member of the Chickasaw Nation. My great-great grandfather was forcibly removed from Mississippi where his family had lived for 500 years. At age 14, he was marched 800 miles to Indian Territory. He and his family lost everything, and my family lost everything again when the state was opened to white settlement and tribal governments were all but dissolved.

But I also know the other side of American history. My great aunt Te Ata, a Chickasaw storyteller and performing artist, has her portrait in the state capital and a 12-foot statue at the college from which she graduated. She delivered the first state entertainment in the Franklin D. Roosevelt White House in March 1933 and performed before the King and Queen of England and the Roosevelts at Hyde Park in 1938. My Chickasaw uncle, whose name I bear, fought at Bataan, was part of the Death March, and survived Japanese prison camps. My father was a career noncommissioned officer, my mom was the first Native American woman elected to the Oklahoma State Senate, and I now serve in Congress. My great-great and great grandfathers, the Chief Clerk of the Chickasaw Supreme Court and the Treasurer of the Chickasaw Nation, respectively, would never have believed it. I hardly believe it myself.

That is what I am interested in celebrating — the nation and the institutions that made that journey possible, even in the face of adversity. I understand that America is imperfect. But I also know that it is on a journey to becoming "a more perfect Union."

Thank you for your consideration, and I look forward to your response.

Sincerely,

Gle

TOM COLE Member of Congress

 ¹⁹ House Labor, Health and Human Services, Education, and Related Agencies Subcommittee, *FY2022 Budget Request for the Department of Education*, oral testimony of Miguel Cardona, May 5, 2021.
 ²⁰ Ibid.

From:	Buettner-Connelly, Sara
То:	Catoe, Tracy; Kegler, Tarkishia
Cc:	Petersen, Molly; Wilson, Linda; Payne, Alexander
Subject:	FW: Rep. Cole letter for Sec. Cardona re Civics Education
Date:	Friday, May 14, 2021 10:52:01 AM
Attachments:	MAY 2021 Letter to Education Dept re Civics Priorities.pdf

To Secy.

Sara B. Connelly

U.S. DoED | Office of Legislation & Congressional Affairs

From: OLCA Inquiries <OLCAInquiries@ed.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 14, 2021 10:51 AM
To: Buettner-Connelly, Sara <S.Buettner-Connelly@ed.gov>
Subject: FW: Rep. Cole letter for Sec. Cardona re Civics Education

From: Hand, Shane <<u>Shane.Hand@mail.house.gov</u>>
Sent: Thursday, May 13, 2021 4:37 PM
To: OLCA Inquiries <<u>OLCAInquiries@ed.gov</u>>
Subject: Rep. Cole letter for Sec. Cardona re Civics Education

Hello,

Please see the attached letter from Mr. Cole for Secretary Cardona regarding the Education Department's proposed priorities for the American History and Civics Education programs.

Shane Hand

Senior Policy Advisor, Health Congressman Tom Cole (OK-04) 2207 Rayburn House Office Building P: 202-225-6165

PLEASE REPLY TO:

 2207 RAYBURN HOUSE OFFICE BUILDING WASHINGTON, DC 20515 (202) 225–6165

 2424 Springer Drive Suite 201
 NORMAN, OK 73069 (405) 329–6500

711 SW D AVENUE
 SUITE 201
 LAWTON, OK 73501
 (580) 357–2131

 SUGG CLINIC OFFICE BUILDING 100 EAST 13TH STREET, SUITE 213 ADA, OK 74820 (580) 436–5375

TOM COLE 4TH DISTRICT, OKLAHOMA

The Diothicit, Okcanolia

DEPUTY WHIP

COMMITTEE ON RULES RANKING REPUBLICAN

COMMITTEE ON APPROPRIATIONS VICE RANKING REPUBLICAN

LABOR, HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, EDUCATION AND RELATED AGENCIES – RANKING REPUBLICAN DEFENSE



Congress of the United States House of Representatives

May 13, 2021

The Honorable Miguel Cardona, Ed.D. Secretary U.S. Department of Education 400 Maryland Ave SW Washington, DC 20202

\$1

Dear Secretary Cardona,

I write to urge you to withdraw the proposed priorities for the American History and Civics Education programs that were published in the Federal Register on April 19, 2021. It is clear from the content of the priorities, as well as the accompanying justification for their proposal, that they will do little more than erode bipartisan support for expanding civics education in the United States by promoting questionable, divisive, and politicized scholarship.

It is no secret that civics education in America is in crisis. Only a quarter of school children have demonstrated proficiency in civics according to the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP). Students scored even lower on the NAEP's history assessment.¹ Furthermore, a study by the Annenberg Public Policy Center determined that 75 percent of Americans could not accurately identify the three branches of government, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation found only 36 percent of Americans could pass the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services' naturalization test – a test that nearly 98 percent of immigrant test-takers pass.^{2,3}

For this reason, I partnered with colleagues in the House and Senate, representing both Republicans and Democrats, to introduce the Civics Secures Democracy Act, which would provide \$1 billion annually toward promoting civics education in elementary and secondary education.⁴ This bill represents bipartisan consensus regarding the need to address civics illiteracy and to educate America's youth on her founding principles, documents, and system of governance.

It is my commitment to civics education that leads me to oppose your department's proposed priorities. These priorities do nothing to ameliorate this pressing problem and threaten to upend bipartisan support for increasing investments in civics education. In the proposed priorities, your department lauds *The New York Times*' 1619 Project as an example of "teaching and learning that reflects the breadth and depth of our

- ³ "National Survey Finds Just 1 in 3 Americans Would Pass Citizenship Test." *The Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation*. https://woodrow.org/news/national-survey-finds-just-1-in-3-americans-would-pass-citizenship-test. Accessed 12 May 2021.
- ⁴ "Civics Secures Democracy Act of 2021." *Congress.gov.* https://www.congress.gov/bill/117th-congress/house-bill/1814?s=1&r=2. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹ "How Did U.S. Students Perform on the Most Recent Assessments?" *The Nation's Report Card*, https://www.nationsreportcard.gov. Accessed 12 May 2021.

² "Americans are Poorly Informed About Basic Constitutional Provisions." *Annenberg Public Policy Center*, https://www.annenbergpublicpolicycenter.org/americans-are-poorly-informed-about-basic-constitutional-provisions. Accessed 12 May 2021.

Nation's diverse history" and demands that grant applicants incorporate practices that highlight our "ongoing national reckoning with systemic racism." It also cites Ibram X. Kendi and his views on "anti-racism."

These references and statements are concerning for a number of reasons. As a former history professor, I certainly support offering diverse perspectives in education, and the goal of the 1619 Project to elevate oftmarginalized stories and individuals in American history is understandable. However, to cite this project as accurate historical analysis is to do damage to history education in American schools because of its welldocumented errors.

The 1619 Project was not developed by trained historians and has been the subject of criticism from leading members of academia concerning its credibility. Gordon Wood, Professor Emeritus of History at Brown University, has called the project "so wrong in so many ways."⁶ Wood and four other eminent historians authored a letter to the *Times* in December 2019, writing that the project's errors, "which concern major events, cannot be described as interpretation or 'framing.' They are matters of verifiable fact, which are the foundation of both honest scholarship and honest journalism. They suggest a displacement of historical understanding by ideology."⁷ Princeton University history professor Sean Wilentz, one of the signatories and an expert on the American Revolution, expounded on his concerns and further stated "no matter how the history is interpreted and related, [it] cannot be forwarded through falsehoods, distortions, and significant omissions."⁸ Unsparing in his criticism, Adolph Reed, Jr., Professor Emeritus of Political Science at the University of Pennsylvania, said the 1619 Project "reflects the agenda of the Democratic Party today."⁹

If you are not familiar with the "falsehoods, distortions, and significant omissions" of the 1619 Project, chief among them are its claims concerning the basis of the American Revolution. In the project's introductory essay, Nicole Hannah-Jones makes the claim that "one of the primary reasons the colonists decided to declare their independence from Britain was because they wanted to protect the institution of slavery."¹⁰ In reducing the American Revolution to little more than a slaveholders' rebellion, this project swats aside the weight of historical evidence and primary sources that run counter to this claim. This assertion disregards the leading role northern colonies took as pioneers of the abolition movement and the influence they had on the abolition of the slave trade, and slavery as a whole, worldwide, as well as the revolution "being a primary *disrupter* of slavery in the North American Colonies."^{11,12} While the 1619 Project argues it was antislavery sentiment in Great Britain, and the resulting colonial fears of impending abolition, that catalyzed the revolution, historical evidence – and indeed the timeline itself – reveals that an organized anti-slavery movement in America predated a comparative movement in Great Britain and, in fact, influenced abolitionism there.¹³

⁹ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with political scientist Adolph Reed, Jr. on the New York Times' 1619 Project." World Socialist Web Site. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/12/20/reed-d20.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹² Harris, Leslie M. "I Helped Fact-Check the 1619 Project. The Times Ignored Me." POLITICO.

⁵ Proposed Priorities—American History and Civics Education, 86 Fed. Reg. 20348 (April 19, 2021)

⁶ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian Gordon Wood on the New York Times' 1619 Project." *World Socialist Web Site*. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/11/28/wood-n28.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

⁷ "We Respond to the Historians Who Critiqued the 1619 Project." The New York Times Magazine.

https://www.nytimes.com/2019/12/20/magazine/we-respond-to-the-historians-who-critiqued-the-1619-project.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

⁸ Wilentz, Sean. "A Matter of Facts." *The Atlantic*. https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2020/01/1619-project-newyork-times-wilentz/605152. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹⁰ Hannah-Jones, Nicole. "Our democracy's founding ideals were false when they were written. Black Americans have fought to make them true." *The New York Times Magazine*.

https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/08/14/magazine/black-history-american-democracy.html. Accessed 12 May 2021. ¹¹ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian Gordon Wood on the New York Times' 1619 Project."

https://www.politico.com/news/magazine/2020/03/06/1619-project-new-york-times-mistake-122248. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹³ Wilentz, Sean. "A Matter of Facts."

Furthermore, the emphasis of the 1619 Project and your department on critical race theory and teaching students that America is irredeemably and systemically racist disregards the complex, differing viewpoints on slavery, race, and discrimination that have existed since our founding, as well as the significant progress America has made. The 1619 Project posits that "anti-black racism runs in the very DNA of this country."¹⁴ While America has worked haltingly throughout her history to extend equal rights and protection under the law to all her children, the notion that America is systemically racist glosses over other moments, individuals, and truths of our history. As Princeton University historian James McPherson explains:

The idea that racism is a permanent condition, well that's just not true. And it also doesn't account for the countervailing tendencies in American history as well. Because opposition to slavery, and opposition to racism, has also been an important theme in American history...From the Quakers in the 18th century, on through the abolitionists in the antebellum, to the radical Republicans in the Civil War and Reconstruction, to the NAACP which was an interracial organization founded in 1909, down through the Civil Rights movement in the 1950s and 1960s, there have been a lot of whites who have fought against slavery and racial discrimination, and against racism. Almost from the beginning of American history that's been true. And that's what's missing from this perspective.¹⁵

Historian James Oakes, Distinguished Professor of History and Graduate School Humanities Professor at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, further explains that such notions are:

not only ahistorical, they're actually anti-historical. The function of those tropes is to deny change over time...We're all in the same boat we were back then. And that's what original sin is. It's passed down. Every single generation is born with the same original sin. And the worst thing about it is that it leads to political paralysis. It's always been here. There's nothing we can do to get out of it. If it's the DNA, there's nothing you can do. What do you do? Alter your DNA?¹⁶

While furthering the idea that racism is an immutable characteristic of the nation, the department also paradoxically supports schools "working to incorporate anti-racist practices into teaching and learning," suggesting that systemic racism is something that can be overcome after all.¹⁷ Racism cannot be both unconquerable and vanquishable. As a tribal citizen, I support teaching and learning practices that instill respect for other races, ethnicities, and cultures. However, I have reservations as to what the department's understanding of "anti-racism" entails, and its relation to civics education, particularly because of its quotation of Ibram X. Kendi, who has written, "The only remedy to past discrimination is present discrimination. The only remedy to present discrimination is future discrimination."¹⁸ That the U.S. Department of Education would lend credence to the notion that the answer to historical injustices is to commit present and future ones is alarming.

For these reasons, I urge you to withdraw these proposed priorities. Civics education is meant to inform our nation's students on the principles and history of our founding and system of governance. It is meant to foster civic participation and to unite Americans of different races, faiths, and backgrounds around a set of common ideals, forging "out of many, one." In your appearance before the House Labor, Health and Human Services, Education, and Related Agencies Subcommittee, you endorsed this idea, sharing, "Yes, we have a

¹⁴ Hannah-Jones, Nicole. "Our democracy's founding ideals were false when they were written. Black Americans have fought to make them true."

¹⁵ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian James McPherson on the New York Times' 1619 Project." *World Socialist Web Site*. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/11/14/mcph-n14.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹⁶ Mackaman, Tom. "An interview with historian James Oakes on the New York Times' 1619 Project." *World Socialist Web Site*. https://www.wsws.org/en/articles/2019/11/18/oake-n18.html. Accessed 12 May 2021.

¹⁷ Proposed Priorities—American History and Civics Education, 86 Fed. Reg. 20349 (April 19, 2021)

¹⁸ Kendi, Ibram X. How to Be an Antiracist. Random House, 2019.

divided country, but our education system is going to unite us. Again, the goal here is to really build community."¹⁹

If the goal is unity and to build community, these proposed priorities will not achieve it. These priorities are deeply divisive, and the elevation of dubious historical scholarship suggests the importance of political narrative over historical fact in civics education. Moreover, the American people do not want federal mandates on the content of their children's education material. In our hearing, your answers on the topic were both contradictory and unclear, especially when you stated the department cannot mandate curriculum but then admitted it could issue certain priorities it wants grantees to include in their applications.²⁰ These answers are sharply at odds with one another.

While I disagree strongly with these priorities and ask for their withdrawal, I would like to extend the offer to work with you on a more bipartisan approach to civics education. Though these priorities are misguided as proposed, I appreciate the intent to incorporate diverse perspectives in history and civics education because I personally understand the importance of race in American history.

I am a member of the Chickasaw Nation. My great-great grandfather was forcibly removed from Mississippi where his family had lived for 500 years. At age 14, he was marched 800 miles to Indian Territory. He and his family lost everything, and my family lost everything again when the state was opened to white settlement and tribal governments were all but dissolved.

But I also know the other side of American history. My great aunt Te Ata, a Chickasaw storyteller and performing artist, has her portrait in the state capital and a 12-foot statue at the college from which she graduated. She delivered the first state entertainment in the Franklin D. Roosevelt White House in March 1933 and performed before the King and Queen of England and the Roosevelts at Hyde Park in 1938. My Chickasaw uncle, whose name I bear, fought at Bataan, was part of the Death March, and survived Japanese prison camps. My father was a career noncommissioned officer, my mom was the first Native American woman elected to the Oklahoma State Senate, and I now serve in Congress. My great-great and great grandfathers, the Chief Clerk of the Chickasaw Supreme Court and the Treasurer of the Chickasaw Nation, respectively, would never have believed it. I hardly believe it myself.

That is what I am interested in celebrating — the nation and the institutions that made that journey possible, even in the face of adversity. I understand that America is imperfect. But I also know that it is on a journey to becoming "a more perfect Union."

Thank you for your consideration, and I look forward to your response.

Sincerely,

Gle

TOM COLE Member of Congress

 ¹⁹ House Labor, Health and Human Services, Education, and Related Agencies Subcommittee, *FY2022 Budget Request for the Department of Education*, oral testimony of Miguel Cardona, May 5, 2021.
 ²⁰ Ibid.

Fred Woehrle

From:	Fred Woehrle
Sent:	Thursday, May 20, 2021 2:47 PM
То:	Howerton, Mia
Subject:	Re: "Proposed Priorities: American History and Civics Education" (proposed rule, April 19, 2021)

The New York Times' 1619 Project is so badly flawed, and makes so many false claims, that the Education Department should not have cited it, and it should not be touted in the Education Department's priorities for the American History and Civics Education programs.

As Education Week points out, "historians have criticized important elements of the 1619 Project." See Andrew Ujifusa, "Biden Administration Cites 1619 Project as Inspiration in History Grant Proposal," Education Week, April 19, 2021. As CNS News points out, the 1619 Project makes false claims about America's history. See Hans Bader, "Biden Incentivizes Schools to Teach Anti-White Racism to 'Remedy' Anti-Black Racism," CNS News, April 22, 2021.

As CNS News explains about the 1619 Project, it made false claims such as saying that "the moment [America] began" was in 1619, and that an incident in that year "is the country's very origin."

That assertion is wrong, as is explained by Timothy Sandefur, author of a well-known biography of Frederick Douglass, "Frederick Douglas: Self-Made Man." See Timothy Sandefur, "The 1619 Project: An Autopsy," The Dispatch, October 27, 2020, available at <u>https://thedispatch.com/p/the-1619-project-an-autopsy</u>

The 1619 Project claimed that "the moment [America] began" was in 1619, when 20 enslaved people were brought ashore in Virginia and sold. This incident, the 1619 Project said, "is the country's very origin." Although the nation's "official birthdate" came in 1776, the 1619 Project claims that it was really "out of slavery—and the anti-black racism it required" that "nearly everything that has truly made America exceptional" grew.

This claim about America's origins is so bizarre that it has been rejected as false by historians of every ideological stripe -- not just liberals, moderates, and conservatives but also socialists. "Despite the pretense of establishing the United States' 'true' foundation, the 1619 Project is a politically motivated falsification of history. It presents and interprets American history entirely through the prism of race and racial conflict," notes the World Socialist web site, citing historians of all ideological persuasions. In reality, the American colonies were first settled in 1607, before any enslaved people arrived on America's shores. Most of the most populous colonies, such as Massachusetts (the birthplace of the American Revolution), did not depend upon slave labor, and abolished slavery soon after America became an independent nation. The northern free states were much more populous and economically advanced than the southern slave states, which helps explain why the South lost the Civil War. So slavery did not cause America's economic development.

In addition to containing false claims about America's origins and founding, the 1619 Project creates a false black-white dichotomy and neglects Asian-American history. Timothy Sandefur describes some of the vitally-important Chinese-American and Japanese-American history it omits, in "The 1619 Project: An Autopsy," The Dispatch, October 27, 2020.

Since it neglects Asian-American history, it is not a good example for "Proposed Priority 1-Projects That

Incorporate Racially, Ethnically, Culturally, and Linguistically Diverse Perspectives into Teaching and Learning."

As former Education Department employee Adam Kissel points out, the proposed priority itself is deficient in another respect. President Biden's Executive Order on supporting underserved communities (Jan. 20, 2021) requires that "the Director of OMB shall, in coordination with the heads of agencies, study strategies, consistent with applicable law, for allocating Federal resources in a manner that increases investment in underserved communities, as well as individuals from those communities."

But Proposed Priority 1, part (b), fails to include "rural areas" or "geographic communities," as mentioned in the Executive Order. Part (b) does not provide equity as defined by President Biden.

The Education Department should not have cited Ibram Kendi, because his views contradict reality, and contradict federal court rulings that are binding on the Education Department. Kendi's bad judgment is reflected in his idolizing a notorious anti-semite.

In Proposed Priority 1, the Education Department says that "As the scholar Ibram X. Kendi has expressed,...'Antiracist ideas argue that racist policies are the cause of racial inequities.'"

But Ibram Kendi advocates widescale discrimination against whites and Asians to 'remedy' blacks' underrepresentation. The 'key concept' in Kendi's book How to Be an Antiracist is that to remedy the underrepresentation of certain minority groups, society needs to engage in discrimination against other groups, such as whites. As Kendi puts it, "the only remedy to racist discrimination is antiracist discrimination. The only remedy to past discrimination is present discrimination. The only remedy to present discrimination is future discrimination." But the sweeping racial discrimination Kendi advocates violates Supreme Court decisions such as Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co., 488 U.S. 469 (1989).

In the eyes of the courts, the remedy to past discrimination is often not present discrimination. Discrimination is supposed to be a "last resort." (Bartlett v. Strickland, 556 U.S. 1, 21 (2009)). Past discrimination against minorities has to involve evidence of discrimination that is both recent and widespread, and by the government itself, to justify present discrimination against whites. (See Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co., 488 U.S. 469 (1989) (Supreme Court rules that "societal discrimination" is not a reason for discrimination against whites); Middleton v. City of Flint, 92 F.3d 396 (6th Cir. 1996) (court rules that only evidence of widespread discrimination suffices, not anecdotes of discrimination); Brunet v. City of Columbus, 1 F.3d 390, 409 (1993) (court rules that discrimination that happened many years earlier did not provide a basis for affirmative action program), citing Hammon v. Barry, 826 F.2d 73, 76-77 (D.C. Cir. 1987)).

Kendi is also inappropriate authority to cite because he turns a blind eye to anti-Semitism. The "heroine" in one of Kendi's books "is a notorious antisemite, Angela Davis," notes law professor David Bernstein. "While Kendi disparages a host of American civil rights heroes, from Frederick Douglass to MLK as being too moderate, Davis is his odd choice as an antiracist exemplar," Professor Bernstein says. "After a dubious acquittal from a charge of conspiracy to murder as part of a Black Panthers jailbreak, she spent the most productive years of her career as an activist for the American Communist Party." She disparaged jailed Jewish dissidents in the Soviet Union as "Zionist fascists and opponents of socialism" who should "be kept in prison." See David Bernstein, "Jewish (and Other) Schools Shouldn't Assign Ibram Kendi's Stamped: a Remix," Times of Israel, October 15, 2020 available at https://blogs.timesofisrael.com/jewish-and-other-schools-shouldnt-assign-ibram-kendis-stamped-a-remix/

Kendi claims that "When I see racial disparities, I see racism." But not all disparities are discriminatory in

nature or in their origins. As the Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals ruled, "disparity does not, by itself, constitute discrimination." (See Belk v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Board of Education, 269 F.3d 305, 332 (4th Cir. 2001) (en banc)).

And as CNS News points out, "Kendi's claim ignores the fact that many racial disparities are not caused by racism. For example, Latinos live three years longer than whites, on average, even though doctors don't discriminate in their favor. Asians make more money than whites, on average, even though Japanese and Chinese Americans suffered massive discrimination in America a century ago. And while blacks make less money than whites, on average, immigrants from some African countries like Ghana and Nigeria typically make more money than whites do. Racial disparities exist everywhere in society and the world, often for reasons unrelated to racism, as the black economist Thomas Sowell chronicles in his book "Discrimination and Disparities." To abolish racial disparities as Kendi seeks to do would require a totalitarian government, says black economist Glenn Loury." See "Biden Incentivizes Schools to Teach Anti-White Racism to 'Remedy' Anti-Black Racism," CNS News, April 22, 2021.

The Education Department quotes Kendi's statement that "racist policies are the cause of racial inequities." The meaning of the word "inequities" in this statement is ambiguous. If "inequities" simply means racial "disparities," then this claim is wrong, because racist policies are not why Hispanics live longer than whites, or why Asians out-earn whites -- or why most other racial disparities exist.

373.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10401	I am a parent and have children in Oregon public schools. We do not want our children taught Critical Race Theory or any other curriculum regarding race. Our schools are failing academically. These Anti-American curriculums detract from the proper role of schools in three ways: 1. Divides people by race, social, and political identities rather than treating them as equal individuals. 2. Rooted in the idea, and teaches children America is irredeemably racist. 3. These divisions do not benefit any group of individuals, and will deepen racial divisions in our country. I know federal agencies are required to take my opinion into account and respond. We will not allow our children to be used by the federal government in this way! Thank you for listening to the people. Let's stick with reading, writing and math and leave controversial politics out of our schools. Sincere regards. Anfisa Piatkoff
374.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10402	I do not want my tax dollars used in public schools to teach critical race theory, which pits individuals against each other and encourages students to judge each other on the color of their skin.
375.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10403	The vast majority of people are not racist and to say the American people are systemically racist is an insult. We are not perfect but we are less racist than any other Country in the world! The promotion of Critical Race Theory and the 1619 project, will not only hurt our children, possibly causing more racist attitudes and it will hurt the public school systems. The effect could be less children going to public schools and into private schools, which will create more pressure to to allow parents to take their students tax money with the student. This could result in large school funding shortages!! Please do not allow Critical Race Theory and the 1619 Project taught in our schools!
376.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10404	No, no, NO to the incorporation of Critical Race Theory and The 1619 Project into public schools! WE, the people, have spoken and are against this proposal.
377.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10405	Please do not indoctrinate our children with the hate filled non-factual CRT programming. You do not end discrimination by encouraging discrimination. MLK Jr would be even more sad than I, as a mother am at seeing our government pursue this lie.
378.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10406	This is about time. If we are to be a truly multicultural society (we already are) it is imperative that students in American schools learn our history in a culturally sensitive way. This prevents the learning of a whites only history and will include the contributions of people of color. The current system for the most part ignores the contributions of anyone other than white men. By focusing on tokens such as Betsy Ross, George Washington Carver and Geronomo we do out future generations a grave disservice. As a white American educated in public schools during the 1960's and 70's, I and millions of other children grew up believing a false narrative that is patently untrue, and diminishes the horrors foisted upon our fellow Americans because of their skin color and one of many items that has contributed to our current race issues today. This country has refused to objectively examine the human tragedy these policies have caused. It about time we really teach our children about the horrors some of our policies have caused, and the many many contributions our people of color have made to this amazing country called America.
379.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10407	Critical Race theory is a racist and divisive curriculum and should never be taught or given to students. It creates an oppressed verses oppressor mandate when this would normally not exist in reality of the classroom. It teaches that lived experience is more important than factual information. It lowers the standards for math, science and English while simultaneously altering history to a liberal and factually false Marxist viewpoint. Critical race theory teaches white kids to hate themselves, teaches minority students that nothing they do will ever allow them equal or more success than the "oppressor", and teaches that immutable characteristics are the most interesting and important part of your identity. We should be teaching students to love America, to themselves and each other and not be afraid to have civil discourse about their beliefs and ideas.
380.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10408	That is the stupidest thing that I have ever heard. Stay out of our schools.
381.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10409	I oppose the use of federal grant funds to bribe schools to promote divisive scholarship and unconstitutional policies in Americas public schools.
382.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10410	Absolutely not! Critical Race Theory and the 1619 project are debunked divisive teachings that will demonize one demonstrate of Americans while promotion apother. How is this not racist? Has America had its past sine? Ves. Vet has

			America fought hard to repent and overcome such evils? 100% yes! We are not a perfect nation but we are not a systemically racist one either. (And if we are, let's consider who runs all of our major institutions from academia to media and entertainment. The Left. So who are the racists?) If we teach our children to judge each other on the basis of color - only this time making white folks the inferior - we desecrate and dishonor the legacy of the Civil Rights movement altogether. Black and brown people do not need to be fed a narrative of victimhood while white people are fed a narrative of oppressor-ship. These categories are toxic and divisive and a flat-out lie. I believe racism is wrong. And there will always be those individuals who harbor it. It's an imperfect world. But let's not intentionally sow it into our future generations of children.
383.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10411	I am definitely in favor of this! Schools need civics and a real version of American History with the harmful effects of discrimination explained.
384.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10412	I am a parent/resident and have children in Ridgefield, Washington schools. We do not want our children taught Critical Race Theory or any other curriculum regarding race. Our schools are failing academically. These Anti- American curriculums detract from the proper role of schools in three ways: 1. Divides people by race, social, and political identities rather than treating them as equal individuals. 2. Rooted in the idea, and teaches children America is irredeemably racist. 3. These divisions do not benefit any group of individuals, and will deepen racial divisions in our country. I know federal agencies are required to take my opinion into account and respond. We will not allow our children to be used by the federal government in this way! Thank you for listening to the people. Sincere regards,
385.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033- 10413	"History repeats itself." This is the remark we always hear. The problem is people are not suppose to instigate the actual repeating of that so called history on purpose. Introducing this type of trash into our history is an absolute slap in the face to the people who had to actually live through slavery and fought for their rights. We are a country of free people. Anybody who thinks they are not free, feel free to take a walk into Asia, Africa or South America for several months. We should acknowledge history and our short comings, but nothing good will come from making our children and future generations think they are oppressed, evil and that this country is no different from any other country. We are a proud people-with a proud history despite a few hiccups. This type of education should never be implanted, and let alone, should have never been proposed in the first place. A thousand times no to this version of history and civics if that did not make my point clear.
386.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10414	Please do not implement any form of critical race theory in public schools. It is wrong! Any curriculum pushing lies by the 1619 project also is harmful to the children of America. This embarrassment of re-writing history should be avoided!
387.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10415	As a mother of four I do not want cultural race theory/racism taught to my children at school and as a teacher I will not teach division and misinformation. Quit setting us back fifty years. The division and lies has to stop!
388.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10416	I strongly disagree with the addition of this proposed new propaganda that you call "curriculum ". We should not be teaching our children the lie that America is founded on racial inequality or racial injustice. Rather the truth, that America was founded by people who wanted to worship God when and how they wanted to worship without retribution by the governments they fled from. We should not be teaching our children to apologize for the color of their skin, they had no choice in the matter. Rather we should be teaching them to love everyone and see people by the content of their character, not by separating people by the color of their skin That is NOT what America was founded on. American was founded on religious liberty, for ALL!! If you continue down this path you will be teaching children to hate people just because of the color of their skin which is the exact opposite of what we should be teaching our children. Please, do not put this philosophy of thinking in our country's schools.
389.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10417	I disapprove that the U.S. Department of Education is promoting aharmful agenda that is driven by racial identity and division. Stick to teaching reading writing and math. it is not the schools duty to teach this subject.
390.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10418	No to critical race theory in any classroom at any age.

391.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10419	This is a travesty. Critical Race Theory and the 1619 project do nothing more than financially incentivize racial division into the minds of our country. They are not based on fact, they are not based in reality, they are based on the opinion of very few that at the moment happen to be speaking loudest. The results of these orders will be huge civil rights violations, lawsuits and social divisions. Joe Biden, his team, the democrat party, and others who do not stand up against this will forever be tarnished by these regulations. Do not do this.
392.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10420	Stop pushing the racist indoctrination called, Critical Race Theory! Our children need to be educated & taught how to think, not be inundated by lies from American hating race baiters! We as parents will fight back to protect our children from that filth & we will win in the courts & on the campuses! Families are fleeing public schools in droves because of the shitty education their children have received. Not to mention how unsafe schools are because of restorative justice. CRT is destructive & racist against children who don't see race or color. They just want to be accepted & feel safe, & be cared for. As a mother of two biracial children, I will never teach this shit, ever! I will never tell my stride that they are white supremacists of the color of their skin, privileged because they come from a traditional nuclear family, or to be blamed for what happened in the past! We as parents trust our schools and teachers to provide our children with the first class education your districts always claim to provide. Once that trust is broken, there will never be a cohesive relationship again! Patriotic living American citizens will fight back against CRT at all costs!
393.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10421	American public education can benefit from the incorporation of diverse student perspectives; however, I do not believe that grants should prioritize instruction that obsess over bias and discriminatory policies in America. IF you want to start a new program, why not, How to handle your money. Open kids eyes to what they need to know in regards to managing money. I think KIDS know more about dealing with racism than most ADULTS. It has been pushed on everyone here lately. You are who you are. Kids see that, don't start making ANYONE apologize for the color of their skin. THERE are people in OUR Government that wants control of everything. They should NOT have ever gotten elected into ANY office! Are GRANTS the upper most thing you are worried aboutYOU SHOULD BE MORE CONCERNED ABOUT THE UNIONS THAT ARE DICTATING HOW AND WHAT THE BOARD OF EDUCATION CAN AND CANNOT DO! IF YOU ALLOW THIS, YOU CARE "NOTHING" FOR THE CHILDREN BEING TAUGHT. STOP INDOCTRINATING AND TEACH. STOP SMEARING OUR HISTORY TO SUIT SOMEONE'S SICK AGENDA. HISTORY I, NOR ANYONE CAN CHANGE THAT JUST REMEMBER YOU CAN EITHER STAND FOR SOMETHING, OR FALL FOR ANYTHING. THAT ANYTHING COULD BE OUR DOWNFALL. DO NOT BE A PART OF WHAT CAUSED IT. TAKE A STAND AND DON'T BACK DOWN. Remember EVERYBODY has a THEORY.
394.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10422	I do not want my tax dollars used in public schools to teach critical race theory, which pits individuals against each other and encourages students to judge each other on the color of their skin.
395.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10423	Anyone who is against "Under this priority, the applicants propose projects that incorporate teaching and learning practices that reflect the diversity, identities, histories, contributions, and experiences of all students create inclusive, supportive, and identity-safe learning environments" is against equality. Period.
396.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10424	Critical race theory and the 1619 project are ideological teachings created to undermine the American education system and culture. I believe adding this to curriculum will not only help to further polarization in the upcoming generations as well as rob our youth of a true and just education that supports American and its values
397.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10425	I believe that this regulation will be beneficial to students in American history and civics education. When students learn about the past and how minorities/marginalized groups were or are oppressed in America, the necessary steps can be taken to prevent that oppression in the future.

			Including different identities in the discussions can bring in more perspectives and increase critical thinking for students. Students are aware of their identities and including them in the conversation will allow them to have a better understanding of themselves. As a trans person, I am well aware of how my identity comes into play in government. Whether I will have equal rights or not is currently up for debate. Having these conversations in school about the affect of the government on marginalized groups will encourage students to think critically about themselves and how they view the world. Furthermore, increasing the quality of these classes can benefit students in the real world. It will help them to understand their rights in America and create informed opinions in politics; with a better quality of education, students will be able to better navigate the world. Reading some of these other comments, it is painfully obvious that some individuals do not understand the workings of the government and how the different levels of government interact within themselves as well as with the public. These regulations will increase the knowledge of students and expose them to not only the good, but also the negative aspects of the United States. Although some of those aspects were in the past, we cannot forget the past lest we repeat our mistakes.
398.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033- 10426	Keep Anti-American Propaganda OUT Of Our Schools! I am a parent/resident and have children in West Hartford Connecticut schools. We do not want our children taught Critical Race Theory or any other curriculum regarding race. Our schools are failing academically. These Anti-American curriculums detract from the proper role of schools in three ways: 1. Divides people by race, social, and political identities rather than treating them as equal individuals. 2. Rooted in the idea, and teaches children America is irredeemably racist. 3. These divisions do not benefit any group of individuals, and will deepen racial divisions in our country. I know federal agencies are required to take my opinion into account and respond. We will not allow our children to be used by the federal government in this way! Thank you for listening to the people. Sincere regards, Patricia O'Connor
399.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10427	I VOTE NOyou cannot use my income to fund a racist program. YES I believe that Critical Race Theory-and that's exactly what this program will teach-is RACIST in itself. Our children black, white, and all shades in between are born pure. This program WILL instill RACIST ideas into the minds of the innocent-forcing them to believe they have HATE in their souls. STOP yourselves from infecting the minds of our children for nothing more than adding funds to your budget and cowering to a political belief that is damning to the human race! I stand Opposed!!!
400.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10428	Implementing these policies will only divide our country further. They are the definition of racist and the proposed teaching materials are blatantly false. I will not allow my children to be told that people identities are exclusive to their skin color or sex. I agree that slavery must be taught about in schools, but this not the way to do it.
401.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10429	This idea is evil. Not only does it produce more division in our country it specifically targets individuals based on skin color. This is evil. It is racist. Critical theory is a Marxist idea and fundamentally opposed to western society at large. It must not be taught in schools.
402.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10430	I oppose the teaching of critical race theory and 1619 project in public schools.
403.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10431	I 100% oppose! My children will never set foot in a pubic class room if this outrageous twist on theories and history is pushed into public schools. The department of education should be ashamed of the garbage that they're pushing down the throats of our children and the institutionalization of them. Our public school system is garbage has been destroyed by politicians like Joe Biden!
404.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10432	I 100% oppose! My children will never set foot in a pubic class room if this outrageous twist on theories and history is pushed into public schools. The department of education should be ashamed of the garbage that they're pushing

			down the throats of our children and the institutionalization of them. Our public school system is garbage has been destroyed by politicians like Joe Biden!
405.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10433	I 100% oppose! My children will never set foot in a pubic class room if this outrageous twist on theories and history is pushed into public schools. The department of education should be ashamed of the garbage that they're pushing down the throats of our children and the institutionalization of them. Our public school system is garbage has been destroyed by politicians like Joe Biden!
406.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10434	I 100% oppose! My children will never set foot in a pubic class room if this outrageous twist on theories and history is pushed into public schools. The department of education should be ashamed of the garbage that they're pushing down the throats of our children and the institutionalization of them. Our public school system is garbage has been destroyed by politicians like Joe Biden!
407.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10435	As a American history buff I am really disappointed that Biden canceled the 1776 report and luckily I have a copy of it I guess Biden never bothered to read it as I was impressed by it and highly recommended to be used in classrooms! The 1619 project has been criticized by many teachers in the history subject field and it should not be used in our classrooms! I live i Hawaii which is a multi racial state and we were taught about the ways of Dr. King, and the history of Lincoln and Harriet Tubman! Many of my classmates were Filipino, Japanese, Caucasian, Hawaiian, etc. we were taught to be nice and respect one another and not judge by our race or the color of our skinl Even myself I'm half Filipino, part Japanese, Caucasian and 1% Cherokee Indian and I learned not to judge each other by the color of our skin but the context of character!
408.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10436	Critical Race Theory contains the TRUTH of our history. The denial of our racist past is equivalent to the dysfunctional family who ignores the truth of the abused daughter rather than confronting the father who abuses her, so as to protect the "idea" of the family. That is a dysfunctional family – we live in a dysfunctional country. Unless we face the darkness in our history, we will continue with fallacies that cripple us as a nation and deny the truth of a very large part of our population, further disenfranchising them. The point of digesting the nation's racist history is NOT to make white people feel bad or guilty. The argument that current white people are not responsible for the past should be met with "You are not responsible for what happened, but you ARE responsible to KNOW about it." This denial, all to keep white guilt at bay, is harmful and stagnating to the society as a whole. Germany sets a prime example of teaching in their schools the history of Nazi-ism and the Holocaust, so as not to repeat it. Decades of whitewashing our history, as well as the absence of Civics classes have damaged our country – literally. I lay some of the blame for the Jan. 6 insurrection on the ignorance and white fragility that can't tolerate criticism of past events at the hands of our white ancestors. Media literacy is also essential teaching in our schools today. The ablify to critically evaluate online sources of information in a realm rife with propaganda from domestic as well as foreign sources is of highest importance these days.
409.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10437	To whom it may concern, It is extremely disheartening to know that our government feels the need to impose controversial ideas into our children's curriculum. Is this not the very way Soviet Russia began their journey to communism? History needs to be presented in an honest and approachable manner. Students need to be able to think objectively and formulate their own opinion with their family unit. Since when is it the Government's place to influence our thinking? Is this not the very reason we are a REPUBLIC? Our history needs to be available and straight forward without an agenda. The moment we allow the government to impose political preferences into the school system we have lost they where all to familiar with the Monarchy in England. I oppose this history/civics overhaul which is created by a controversial author.
410.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10438	American public education can benefit from the incorporation of diverse student perspectives; however, I do not believe that grants should prioritize instruction that obsess over bias and discriminatory policies in America.

411.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10439	I disapprove that the U.S. Department of Education is promoting aharmful agenda that is driven by racial identity and division.
412.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10440	I do not want my tax dollars used in public schools to teach critical race theory, which pits individuals against each other and encourages students to judge each other on the color of their skin.
413.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10441	Absolutely NO critical race theory and 1619 project in classrooms!
414.	5/10/21	ED-2021-0ESE-0033-10442	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.
415.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10443	No to Critical Race Theory!!!!! I will not allow my child to be taught this naturally racist curriculum. We will pull our children from public education if this passes. I will not allow my children to be told the color of their skin has anything to do with their character or if they can succeed or not. NO, NO, NO TO CRITICAL RACE THEORY!!!!!!!!
416.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10444	No. This will only further divide Americans, CRT is Marxism disguised as social justice. Dont fall for it, this will destroy our country's future if implemented in our schools curriculums.
417.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10445	I don't believe we should use this content to have competitions. I believe that we should use this content to just learn about America and to better understand what we need to do in the future to make America better than it already is.
418.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033- 10446	This is an absolute travesty. Invest your time and resources in teaching students to not see color or race. This curriculum creates division and fosters hate. As the President you vowed to bring unity and all you've done is continue to divide. Shame on you.
419.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10447	Critical Race Theory is counterproductive to its goals. Rather than simply educating students of past issues that existed in the United States, it inappropriately equates statistics with racism rather than other economic, demographic, and geographic factors. Please do not implement this flawed theory into curriculums.
420.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10448	As a queer black person who grew up in the south, talking about race, gender and sexuality is critical to the development of young people and their ability to thrive and work together in our diverse society. To omit these conversations, is to set all of us up for failure. We have not been able to address and talk about our history in a productive way that centers the people who have been wronged, and that has gotten us to where we are today, where neighbors are killed, the Capitol is raided, and people are more divided than ever. Teaching a more comprehensive history is not just morally the right thing to do (though that should be enough), it's also a matter of national security, domestic safety, and upholding our democratic values. Anything short is biased propaganda that we accuse and punish other countries for.
421.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10449	As a concerned American citizen, a former teacher in the California schools, and a mother of 5, I ask that you please do not introduce Critical Race Theory into our education system! Our education system is already belaboring with simply trying to teach the basics in academics. We have diminished our Science education, now our Math is being looked at to diminish because Asians excell there and we don't want someone to do better than someone else in their natural talents and giftings. This is ridiculous. Let every human excel in whatever they are good at - be it a subject in school, sports, music, or communication skills. We are all born with differences there - not skin color, but giftings and each child should be encouraged to shoot for the sky in their gifted area, not told there skin color defines them as an advantages or disadvantaged person. We already score way below so many other countries in the world. This should not be! How can we compete in the global market when our academics are so lacking? As educators, we struggle to just get the students to learn the basic subjects of school. We don't have time to insert other things that will discourage a student from trying hard because they were born at a disadvantage. Kids need to be told they have all the abilities in them to do and accomplish whatever they set their minds to. I have close friends of all colors and races here in California and we love each other. We don't need schools to pit us against one other telling us to resent one color over another or telling one of us we can succeed and another one we can't because of our

			skin! That is not what Martin Luther King taught!! We need to go back and listen to his words that we would not judge anyone by the color of their skin, but rather by their character and abilities.
422.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10450	Do not allow "critical race theory" or the "1619 project" to be allowed as curricula in school. These are as anti- American as they come and are themselves pushing racism.
423.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10451	The Education Departments citations of curriculum and scholarship for these grants are flawed at best, and both incorrect at worst. TheNew York Timess 1619 Project has been heavily criticized by historians as inaccurate; even the World Socialist web sitenotesthat Despite the pretense of establishing the United States true foundation, the 1619 Project is a politically motivated falsification of history. It presents and interprets American history entirely through the prism of race and racial conflict.
424.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10452	I am deeply concerned with CRT in public classrooms, this is an anti-American ideology. Parents should not have to live with concern that their children are being indoctrinated by radical leftist ideals. This is ludicrous and I am 150% opposed to using my tax dollars to promote anti-American ideals that continue to divide our country.
425.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033- 10453	The DOE needs to look at their failing policies they have now, and fix them. Do not continue to sow hate on our children. Your job is to teach them to read and do math on proper grade levels not to make excuses to hate each other. If a fifth grader can not read at a 5th grade level teaching them it is because of the color of their skin is not solving the problem. Just teach them how to read not how to hate. You are pushing lies and propaganda on our youth that is not beneficial to any class or race of people. Stop worrying about the democrats poll numbers and start worrying about teaching our wonderful children. You are being paid to teach all children equally. Keep the filthy politics out of our class rooms and teach the children so they can make reasonable decisions as adults based on facts instead of lies and hate. Our school district is at 60% in reading and 58% in math. These students do not need your opinions dumped on them. They need instructions founded on facts not hate. If you put this racist hate in our classrooms I will homeschool. My guardian has to deal with her mother having mental illness. We work at home with her problems and she goes to school to learn, be with other children and feel normal. She does not need your classure from school because of her skin color. Do not dump the world's problem on her tiny shoulders. It is not the governments job to force grown up rhetoric into our classrooms. This mind set of adults throwing their politics on these poor children is disgusting if not criminal. Child abuse. Let them be children while they can.
426.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10454	Adapting the teachings of the history of our government and country as we develop in both areas is well needed and I think that it has become well apparent. I am not as familiar with the two programs wanting to be included but I think that looking into our civics and government classes and finding areas for revision is an effective step towards creating an ever evolving and quality education.
427.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10455	I am in support of the proposed rule by the Department of Education. We need to be educated about the scope of white supremacy and racism in our history and current times. People in all stages of academia need to be taught to think critically about racism and how it impacts our laws and the way we treat and think about our fellow humans. If we can't recognize systemic racism, how can we talk about its effects? Denial is not patriotic. Educating ourselves is the only way to creating a more just country.
428.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10456	I object to CRT and the 1619 project being taught in American classrooms. It is racist and seeks to indoctrinate young people into this cancerous ideology. Parents, like myself, are pulling their children from public education in droves due to these curriculums. Stop indoctrinating and start educating.
429.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10457	Ibram X. Kendi has asserted that to remedy the underrepresentation of certain minority groups, you need to engage in discrimination against other groups, such as whites: the only remedy to racist discrimination is antiracist discrimination. The only remedy to past discrimination is present discrimination. The only remedy to present discrimination is future discrimination." The sweeping racial discrimination Kendi advocates violates federal anti- discrimination law. which should not be funded with federal resources.

430.	5/10/21	ED-2021-OESE-0033-10458	Critical race theory is not productive to the education system. It teaches children what they can and can't achieve based on their skin color. That is not the truth. This is not what Martin Luther King jr. talked about. A child should be told to reach for the stars! That only they can hold themselves back. Is there injustice in America's history? Sure, but we need to learn from our past. not repeat it.
431.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10459	I oppose the use of federal grant funds to bribe schools to promote divisive scholarship and unconstitutional policies in Americas public schools.
432.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10460	The Education Departments citations of curriculum and scholarship for these grants are flawed at best, and both incorrect at worst. TheNew York Timess 1619 Project has been heavily criticized by historians as inaccurate; even the World Socialist web sitenotesthat Despite the pretense of establishing the United States true foundation, the 1619 Project is a politically motivated falsification of history. It presents and interprets American history entirely through the prism of race and racial conflict.
433.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10461	I oppose the use of federal grant funds to bribe schools to promote divisive scholarship and unconstitutional policies in Americas public schools.
434.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10462	I am an American citizen, and have raised 4 children along with my husband. I want to make my feelings known to this group who seem to have authority to push the Critical Race Theory upon the whole of the Education system in our country. I reject the premise that this country is intentionally oppressive to people that have either been born here, or have immigrated legally and become US citizens. I do feel we are all responsible for our own actions toward others, but all of us have some hard things to deal with in life. We don't need to be taught that we are victims of others, we need to learn to manage our hard things that come to everyone. Illness, loss of jobs, loss of friends, and death. It isn't because of others. We have to take responsibility to teach our children how to manage those inevitable hard things, and and realize that being a victim is not a way to advance in life. Being responsible for ourselves and others is a much more productive way to teach a child to grow into a productive and valuable citizen. Learning to be grateful for all the freedoms that this country providesmore than any other nation on the earthhelps us realize that we all have a part in making this life better for all. Please try to see my prospective. I do not want children of this country to drop into the victim thinking. Why do you think this is valuable or profitable for the country? This so-called theory is not validated with any research, whereas learning to take responsibility has proven to be valuable for our families, friends, and our country down through time, no matter what race we are in. Being grateful is valuable for our country for all the victimsthat is wrong!
435.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10463	This is bullshit. Nothing like this should be a part of education! No political propaganda should be pushed in classrooms on any level!!!
436.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10464	We must teach our children "historical facts"; not the truth that activists want taught. We should allow parents to take their education tax dollars with their child to the school of their choice. Teach actual history, math, with right and wrong answers and factual science, not half truths that activists claim.
437.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10465	President Biden, I am opposed to the Critical Race Theorem being taught. It will hurt our country & not benefit our children & their education. A Patriot - Love America curriculum is needed!
438.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10466	I do not want my tax dollars used in public schools to teach critical race theory, which pits individuals against each other and encourages students to judge each other on the color of their skin.
439.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10467	Please do not teach children that they are at a disadvantage because of the color of their skin. This is NOT how kids thrive. We live in a country that anyone can succeed, regardless of where they come from! CRT is racist!!!
440.		ED-2021-OESE-0033-10468	Ibram X. Kendi has asserted that to remedy the underrepresentation of certain minority groups, you need to engage in discrimination against other groups, such as whites: the only remedy to racist discrimination is antiracist discrimination. The only remedy to past discrimination is present discrimination.

		discrimination is future discrimination." The sweeping racial discrimination Kendi advocates violates federal anti- discrimination law, which should not be funded with federal resources.
441.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11723	The Education Departments citations of curriculum and scholarship for these grants are flawed at best, and both incorrect at worst. TheNew York Timess 1619 Project has been heavily criticized by historians as inaccurate; even the World Socialist web sitemotesthat Despite the pretense of establishing the United States true foundation, the 1619 Project is a politically motivated falsification of history. It presents and interprets American history entirely through the prism of race and racial conflict.
442.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11725	How do you justify abandoning historical education for indoctrination in public education? The 1619 project is only going to further divide us as a nation. I am saying NO to critical race theory being implemented in the public education system. It is brain washing and it is wrong!
443.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11727	This is one of the most discriminatory efforts by radicals in years. Teaching white guilt and holding today's Americans for the sins of the long ago past is despicable. America has done more than any other country to right its wrongs. There is no systemic racism except in the minds of those that pursue this unproven and anti-American effort
444.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11728	This will simply create division, NOT fix it. This is not what America stands for.
445.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11736	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.
446.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11739	We need to find common ground. Please stop using decisive education. No, on the critical race theory!
447.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11740	The 1619 project and CRT are causing terrible harm to all the races of our country. CRT ideas are akin to the KKK as they subscribe to segregation. Please do NOT put these extremely dangerous ideas into our schools. I am not just my skin color but I should be known for my character.
448.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11742	Ibram X. Kendi has asserted that to remedy the underrepresentation of certain minority groups, you need to engage in discrimination against other groups, such as whites: the only remedy to racist discrimination is antiracist discrimination. The only remedy to past discrimination is present discrimination. The only remedy to present discrimination is future discrimination." The sweeping racial discrimination Kendi advocates violates federal anti- discrimination law, which should not be funded with federal resources.
449.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11743	Keep Anti-American Propaganda OUT Of Our Schools! I am a 100% Mexican American parent and my husband is half Native American. We have children in the Highline school district and we do NOT want our children taught Critical Race Theory or any other curriculum regarding race. I currently have pulled my middle schooler from the public school system (my 2nd child will be next) and although would like to put them back in public school for highschool, I absolutely will not if this ridiculousness continues (along with the sex ed nonsense, teaching kids they can choose their gender and pronouns, ect) Our schools are failing academically. These Anti-American curriculums detract from the proper role of schools in three ways: 1. Divides people by race, social, and political identities rather than treating them as equal individuals. 2. Rooted in the idea, and teaches children America is irredeemably racist. 3. These divisions do not benefit any group of individuals, and will deepen racial divisions in our country. When I was growing up, I never thought twice about being different and was one of a few "brown people" at the schools I absuiness (in the Highline School District). When I was a junior at the UN. My parents helped my by closing out funds from their altended (in the Highline School District). When I was a junior at the University of WA, I bought my first business. I rebuilt and relocated that business while a senior at the UW. My parents helped my by closing out funds from their life insurance policy. One year after that, while running and working at work for Merill Lynch. Not was working the IW herewing and working the financial services industry. No ONE has ever kept me from achieving anything and working the IW Not was working the funded for the Highline set in the Pixe Market. Another year after that, while running and working at the form their life insurance policy. One year after starting business in my new location, I opened a restaurant with a business in everyday, I started a business in the financial adv

		people want to achieve greatness, they only have to put in the effort and hard work. That is what makes this country great! If they become distracted by race, that is their own problem. They are choosing to focus on something that isn't there. There will always be people who dislike other races or have assumptions about a certain race, but that also applies to all races (i.e. black people not liking white people, Middle Eastern people hating Americans, ect). We should not be shining a light and creating a problem that hasn't been there. Kids are growing up in mixed schools and don't inherently have those thoughts against each other, we should not be the ones to make it a problem and make them feel guilty for feelings they likely have never had or the actions of the generations before them. It's purely disgusting. We should only be teaching our children to love all people. I know federal agencies are required to take my disgusting into account and respond. We will not allow our children to be used by the federal government in this mort and respond.
450.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11750	I do not want my tax dollars used in public schools to teach critical race theory, which pits individuals against each other and encourages students to indee each other on the color of their skin
451.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11752	I vehemently oppose teaching CTR in ANY schools. IMO this would only PROMOTE racism, hate, and inequality. I am NOT a white supremacist, do NOT teach small children that I am. Why not teach CIVICS instead??
452.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11764	
453.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11766	By simply attempting to tie tax dollars to the promotion of Critical Race Theory (CRT) and the 1619 Project is enormously racist! A government that promotes hatred and division is not a government for the people, but a government for itself. CRT and the 1619 Project are not based on any objective data or historical facts at all. In fact, none of it can be verified or stress tested. Do not enact this!!
454.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11769	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.
455.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11779	NO critical race theory in our public schools!!!!!
456.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11781	Don't not put critical rave theory into our education systems. It's divisive founders are blatantly seeking to stoke racism in America. Most kids don't give a damn about race in this country
457.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11789	I disapprove that the U.S. Department of Education is promoting aharmful agenda that is driven by racial identity and division. They are supposed to be the educators . We are different Nationalities and cultures . We are human beings of the human race ! Stop the insanity . Our color does not have breed hate . Hateful, ignorant , evil people do !
458.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11792	STOP TRYING TO DESTROY OUR YOUTH AND OUR COUNTRY WITH DIVISIVE AND TOXIC PROPAGANDA FORM OF "EDUCATION". WE NEED A 1776 PROJECT. DO NOT PASS THIS OR EVEN LET IT BE A SUGGESTION IN OUR CLASSROOMS.
459.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11793	Critical race theory teaching our children racism is every where at all times does not belong in our classrooms. We should not teach kids to judge people by skin color!
460.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-11803	I think it's fantastic that we are finally making some of this stuff a priority.
461.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12121	Critical race theory is a distorted, thus, incorrect version of history. It focuses on race over freedom and American values. It should not be taught in our country's classrooms.

462.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12123	I do not supportive indoctrination of children or young adults through Critical Race theory or 1619 project. Public education will only create deeper divides. DO NOT PASS THIS.
463.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12126	I strongly support the proposed priorities for American History and Civics Education. Unless the US can adequately face and address (and seek to redress) its shameful history within its borders and without, we will not deserve to be relevant on a world stage.
464.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12129	Critical Race Theory should NEVER be taught to our children! This profoundly disgusting garbage is what created division and hate. Our tax dollars should not be funding a curriculum based on teaching children to judge people by their skin color and to hate themselves if they were born white. The fact that this even has to be said is sad and beyond disappointing. Democrats only know how to use race wars and divide people. We've had enough. The public school system will cripple if this grotesque abomination is rolled out. Teach our children real education and leave out politics. The Democrat partv should be ashamed of what they have done to this nation.
465.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12132	
466.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12141	I do not want my tax dollars used in public schools to teach critical race theory, which pits individuals against each other and encourages students to judge each other on the color of their skin.
467.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12142	This is an absolute disgrace. Our countries founding principle is freedom, not racism. Are there evils in our past? Of course. But to teach kids that the entire driving force of our country is racism is divisive, manipulative, and above all FALSE. This is nazi level indoctrination. Race as a concept itself is completely made up and based on superficial features. Anthropologists dispelled the idea that there is more than one human race generations ago. This cannot be enacted if the United States has any chance to remain a free and just country.
468.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12144	

		details or our horrific past? I call hogwash on that, as I can recall many times in which these details were not spared from my ears. It helped me grow. In my 16 years of public education I read numerous stories, listened to my teachers prose on various angles, and was assigned fantastic literature, all of which helped me understand our history from different peoples perspectives (might I
		say sum neiging me snape a proud and positive idea or our country nonemeless). Learning mis way helps us all grow. We didn't grow up being taught from the most basic and radical racist notion of "critical race theory". It was common sense that our nation has grown up from a past time, a time before now. We lived the experience together, doing our best. The woke mob, with 20/20 hindsight, would say this was never their America. But I believe that comes from a standpoint of hate, and hate is no capacity for understanding or creation. We didn't create America yesterday, or even 45 years ago, we've been evolving since we came here as a new colony, and have endured and endeavored. We've all tread on this land together from our first arrivals - warts and all - all of us advancing in history in the same sufferable world. Nobody is parfect and no country is parfect. We strive to be
469.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12150	I hat being said, I vote no on critical race theory. I vote yes on explaining history as we always have, allowing us to learn from the past. I reckon we can continue to achieve that result, while allowing us to also learn why America was and still is shining on a hill, with faith in humanity. CRT is racism disguised as progression. This divisive and false ideology is abusive to children and teaches them to either be victims or produces guilt and shame for nothing that they did but due to their immutable characteristics.
470.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12160	We the people do not want this generation and future generations to be taught critical race theory and the ideas of the 1619 project. It is not the government's job to indoctrinate the children of America. You have overstepped your power and we will take it from you. Financh is enough
471.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12163	Well systemic racism it is then. Nothing could be more worthless nor against the rights and responsibilities of the individual than claiming one is guilty of a, potentially uninformed, perception of his or her ancestors' sins. The state has no right to enforce the rights of some over others. Race could truly not be a less important thing in 2021, but politician after politician continue to use it to politically and morally grandstand. Stop pushing this backward, resentful ideology.
472.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12166	It is my strong opinion that the 1619 project is contrary to reality and would foster greater public divide amongst US Citizens. The US was the first country to abolish slavery and fought a civil war to end it. We are the most free the most diverse and least racist nation on the planet. We welcome immigration and recognize the benefits while continuing to promote equal OPPORTUNITY so to teach our children otherwise is reckless and would only support a globalist viewpoint and be contrary the real history of our great country.
473.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12173	As a historian, an economist, and a teacher do not force these ideas onto children. Not only have they been repeatedly debunked, refuted, and dismissed by many like myself, they only cause division and harm to those who are taught this ideology. If religion is not to be forced in public schools, then this religion too needs to stay out of schools.
474.	ED-2021-OESE-0033- 12176	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.

475.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12178	critical race theory promotes nothing but hatred and racism. that is not what america is about! you cannot put this into schools
476.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12182	Changes to incorporate the 1619 project, critical race theory, or any other similarly racist propaganda, in the public school system should be abandoned immediately.
477.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12184	Critical race theory is detrimental to our children and the welfare of our country and is racist. It should not be taught to our children. We need to get back to our history and what unites us, not what divides us. I am concerned about my grandchildren's education and CRT is wrong!!!! Teresa Anders
478.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12186	Please don't make critical race Theory a part of our public education system. As a black person this is not only highly offensive but also just ignorant. Critical Race Theory implies that every aspect of my life is a Direct result of racism when I assure you it is not. My mother did very well financially when I was growing up and I knew that in the USA I could be what ever I wanted to be. Aside from the disgusting bigotry of this theory it is also just untrue, simple facts it states are wrong and it jumps to conclusions faster than anything I've seen before. Please don't force this on our country's children, it won't "start a conversation" it will silence the white ones (for fear of offending someone)and terrify the black ones.
479.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12188	I do not believe that the government should require nor be able to have schools to teach critical race theory. It's nonsense. They are creating issue where there is none and forcing students to confirm their beliefs and morals by teaching it.
480.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12192	I am a mother of 2 biracial children and I OPPOSES Critical Race Theory and the 1619 Project being taught in any of our schools. As a mother of mixed race children, I will not have them taught anything that makes them feel like they are less than or oppressed simply because they are not white. We believe in the power and righteousness of being color blind and that people should be treated in accordance to their caricature and NOT the color of their skin. Sincerely Kathleen
481.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12194	Please do not allow CRT to be taught in schools! I'm a refugee but I look white, I get blamed for things I don't even know of. I wish that instead of focusing on how to separate us we can just focus on respect. CRT does not help me as a minority. It divides us more. Please do not allow this to be taught in schools or anywhere!
482.	ED-2021-OESE-0033- 12196	This administration should NOT support the efforts to rewrite and distort history. Historians have debunked the 1619 project and critical race THEORY is also based on a false premise. Efforts to indoctrinate students with racist and divisive ideas is Anti-American. We are not a Marxist country and this is pure propaganda.
483.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12199	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.
484.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12206	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.
485.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12209	DO NOT encourage the teaching of racism and false history in our classrooms. Stop trying to teach children that their skin color is their defining characteristic. Stop teaching them that their skin color defines them as either victim or oppressor Stop teaching hate. NO CRITICAL RACE THEORY OR 1619 PROJECT IN SCHOOLS.
486.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12211	Vote NO!!!!

487.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12493	I just want to voice my support for teaching critical race theory in schools, or at least using it as tool in curriculum. I think it could be supremely helpful in making our society more understanding and bridging our divides by helping us better understand one another.
488.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12502	I truly believe the comments in opposition to this proposal illustrate the deep need for it. So much of our curriculum and so many of our textbooks have whitewashed our history and culture, placing White people at the center and all others on the periphery. As a White former educator, I am culpable. It's time to stop avoiding the injustices in our history and give voice to those who haven't been head. Though it's deeply threatening to many in our existing societal framework to step back and let other voices, experiences, and histories take the fore, it's time. It's post time. Children deserve to learn the full truth of the past, have a voice in the present, and get equal opportunities to shape the future. Therefore, I'm in full support of this proposal.
489.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12505	Why must we rewrite history? History does not change. History is based on facts, not how someone wants to "portray those facts" to fit a narrative.
490.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12509	American public education can benefit from the incorporation of diverse student perspectives; however, I do not believe that grants should prioritize instruction that obsess over bias and discriminatory policies in America.
491.	ED-2021-OESE-0033-12512	American History and Civics Education grants should not be tied to the recommended teaching and learning practices that the proposed rule recommends and under no circumstances should they be absolute requirements for grant applications.

United States Senate

WASHINGTON, DC 20510

May 18, 2021

VIA ELECTRONIC DELIVERY

The Honorable Miguel Cardona Secretary U.S. Department of Education 400 Maryland Avenue SW Washington, DC 20202 The Honorable Merrick Garland Attorney General of the United States U.S. Department of Justice 950 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington, DC 20530

Dear Secretary Cardona and Attorney General Garland:

We write to express our concern over the effect of punitive and discriminatory school disciplinary measures. All students, no matter their race, color, national origin, religion, sex (including sexual orientation and gender identity) or disability, deserve access to a safe, inclusive and supportive learning environment.

The Federal Government plays a critical role in ensuring that schools provide equitable environments for students, free of discrimination. *Brown v. Board of Education*, Title VI of the Civil Rights Act, the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act, Title IX of the Educational Amendments Act and the Americans with Disabilities Act all affirm this mandate.

While we are grateful for your work to support students during the pandemic, there is much more work to do to protect students from the harms of overly harsh discipline practices. Out-of-school suspensions have escalated significantly since the 1970s. Schools started adopting harsh discipline policies like "zero tolerance" in the 1990s. Exclusionary school policies do not work; they impede student success, with research showing that strict school discipline inhibits a student's chance of attending an institution of higher education.

Unfortunately, these policies have led to sharp increases in school expulsions and suspensions. Black and Hispanic students, American Indian and Alaska Native students, LGBTQ students, students with disabilities and English learners experience the brunt of the consequences, shuffling them into the school-to-prison pipeline, denying them an education, and limiting their future opportunities.

According to a U.S. Government Accountability Office review, elementary and secondary schools disproportionately discipline Black students, American Indian and Alaska Native students, male students and students with disabilities. Although Black students represent 15.5 percent of the public school enrollment, they account for 39 percent of students suspended from school. As exclusionary school discipline policies continue to exacerbate racial inequities within

public education, studies have shown fairer and more effective alternatives. Building positive school climates, including through the faithful implementation of restorative justice practices, which provides social-emotional support to students and holds them accountable, can help reduce racial disparities by building trust instead of pain.

Under the Obama administration, we began to see changes at the State and local level to mitigate the criminalization of Black students in the education system with the promotion of the restorative justice framework. The Obama administration's school discipline guidance, issued in 2014 to assist schools receiving Federal financial assistance, improved schools' understanding of their obligations under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act, and in doing so, helped students receive a safe, equitable education. Following the implementation of alternative disciplinary measures, school suspensions began to decrease. In fact, data from the Office for Civil Rights reported that students were less likely to be suspended in 2016 than they were in 2012—though racial disparities were still present.

In 2019, however, the Trump administration rescinded this guidance. Under the Trump administration, the Department of Education withdrew nearly 600 pieces of guidance set forth under the Obama administration. Although the Trump administration rescinded the Obama administration's discipline guidance, it did not change local education entities' obligations under the law. This rescission frustrated school districts' ability to understand their Federal civil rights obligations.

These events demonstrate how crucial it is that the U.S. Department of Education and Department of Justice (Departments) fully enforce Title VI of the Civil Rights Act, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act, the Americans with Disabilities Act, the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, and Title IX of the Educational Amendments Act. These Departments must protect students from discrimination. The enforcement of students' civil rights is particularly critical as schools continue to reopen safely and students readjust to the physical classroom setting and navigate the emotional toll of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Your respective Departments should support this transition by providing guidance that would help schools reduce school suspensions, especially for students of color, LGBTQ students, students with disabilities and English learners. Therefore, we ask your Departments to address discriminatory and harsh punitive discipline practices that hinder students' opportunity to become contributing members of society by issuing guidance that would:

- 1. Strengthen the Obama administration's previous guidance on the nondiscriminatory administration of school discipline;
- 2. Encourage that schools revise their discipline policies to focus on restorative justice practices, to include guidance containing detailed, updated recommendations on how to best enforce alternative discipline practices;

- 3. Encourage schools to adopt sufficient and continuous training as they work on sustainable, alternative disciplinary practices with training that includes education on trauma-informed practices, implicit bias training and anti-racism training, along with training for specific school personnel to be full-time restorative practice coordinators; and
- 4. Identify Federal funding streams that may be used to provide students with school-based services to meet their social, emotional and mental health needs by hiring mental health providers, such as school counselors, nurses, social workers and psychologists and utilizing restorative justice programs and other proven methods to address student health and wellbeing.

Thank you for your attention to this matter; we look forward to working with you all in addressing this critical civil rights issue.

Sincerely,

Tammy Virekwatt

Tammy Duckworth United States Senator

Michael Bennet United States Senator

Tina Smith United States Senator

Christopher S. Murphy United States Senator

Cory A. Booker United States Senator

Elizabeth Warren United States Senator

Ju/L.

Tim Kaine United States Senator

- Cover

Robert P. Casey, Jr. United States Senator

Buf Sanders

Bernard Sanders United States Senator

Shurrod Brown

Sherrod Brown United States Senator

R., UNW=

Raphael Warnock United States Senator

Alex Padilla United States Senator

Fowler, Darlene

Subject:	FW: Key Summary Item: Senator Duckworth-Led Joint Letter to the Honorable Miguel Cardona -
	Guidance on School Discipline Policy
Attachments:	21.05.18 - Senator Duckworth-Led Joint Letter to Secretary of Education Cardona and Attorney General Garland - Improve Guidance on School Discipline Policy - Final.pdf
Importance:	High

Tarkishia (Kishia) Kegler Deputy Director Correspondence, Communications & Control Unit Office of the Secretary U.S. Department of Education Phone: 202-401-1908 Email: <u>tarkishia.kegler@ed.gov</u>

Express Gratitude | Set Your Intentions for Today | Take Five Deep Breaths | Forgive Yourself for Yesterday's Mistakes

From: Buettner-Connelly, Sara <S.Buettner-Connelly@ed.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, May 19, 2021 11:00 AM

To: Catoe, Tracy <<u>Tracy.Catoe@ed.gov</u>>; Kegler, Tarkishia <<u>Tarkishia.Kegler@ed.gov</u>>

Cc: Petersen, Molly < Molly.Petersen@ed.gov>; Winters, Kalila < Kalila.Winters@ed.gov>

Subject: FW: Senator Duckworth-Led Joint Letter to the Honorable Miguel Cardona - Guidance on School Discipline Policy

To Secy

Sara B. Connelly U.S. DoED | Office of Legislation & Congressional Affairs

From: OLCA Inquiries <<u>OLCAInquiries@ed.gov</u>> Sent: Wednesday, May 19, 2021 9:48 AM To: Buettner-Connelly, Sara <<u>S.Buettner-Connelly@ed.gov</u>> Subject: FW: Senator Duckworth-Led Joint Letter to the Honorable Miguel Cardona - Guidance on School Discipline Policy

From: Rhodeside, Benjamin (Duckworth) <<u>Benjamin_Rhodeside@duckworth.senate.gov</u>>
 Sent: Tuesday, May 18, 2021 6:09 PM
 To: OLCA Inquiries <<u>OLCAInquiries@ed.gov</u>>
 Cc: Bankston-Carter, Chanel (Duckworth) <<u>Chanel_Bankston-Carter@duckworth.senate.gov</u>>
 Subject: Senator Duckworth-Led Joint Letter to the Honorable Miguel Cardona - Guidance on School Discipline Policy

Good evening,

Please find attached a final signed PDF version of a joint letter led by Senator Tammy Duckworth and signed by Senators Murphy, Bennet, Booker, Smith, Warren, Kaine, Brown, Casey, Warnock, Sanders and Padilla, addressed to Secretary of Education Miguel Cardona (and also to Attorney General of the United States Merrick Garland). The joint letter requests that your respective Departments coordinate to improve guidance on school disciplinary policy to address discriminatory and harsh punitive displace practices and improve policies to prioritize restorative justice, training and school-based services.

If you have any questions, please let me or Chanel Bankston-Carter know.

Thank you, Ben

Benjamin Rhodeside Legislative Director Senator Tammy Duckworth



May 13, 2021

The Honorable Miguel Cardona Secretary of Education U.S. Department of Education 400 Maryland Avenue, SW Washington, D.C. 20202

Dear Secretary Cardona:

The Council of Parent Attorneys and Advocates (COPAA) is a national nonprofit organization of parents, attorneys, advocates, and related professionals; over 90% of whom identify as having a disability; or are parents or family members of individuals with disabilities. COPAA works to protect the civil rights and secure excellence in education on behalf of the 8 million children with disabilities in America. COPAA's mission is to serve as a national voice for special education rights and is grounded in the belief that every child deserves the right to a quality education that prepares them for meaningful employment, higher education, and lifelong learning, as well as full participation in their community.

On March 7, 2019 in *COPAA v. DeVos*, the U.S. District Court for the District of Columbia found that the U.S. Department of Education (the Department) had engaged in an 'illegal delay' of the 2016 Equity in IDEA regulations.ⁱ The decision required the Department to ensure states immediately implemented w which required states to implement the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) requirements relating to significant racial disproportionality, originally scheduled to go into effect on July 1, 2018.

Today, we are writing to raise several issues that COPAA considers to be in conflict with the March 7, 2019 decision. Specifically, we ask the Department to address the following issues:

1. STATES' REPORTING OF SIGNIFICANT DISPROPORTIONALITY METHODOLOGY INFORMATION

In its January 23, 2020 memorandum to States, "Procedures for Receiving a Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2020 Grant Award Under Part B of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA)" states were directed to complete the "Significant Disproportionality Reporting Form" as part of the IDEA Part B State grant award application package. (See Appendix A Significant Disproportionality Reporting Form). Item #7 of the memorandum also reminds states that they must adhere to requirements of GEPA regarding public participation requirements.

The Significant Disproportionality Reporting Form was created as an electronic submission form, likely for the convenience of states. However, the completed form did not become part of a state's application package that was posted for public review and comment. This resulted in

stakeholders being denied access to this information, both during the review/comment period in 2020 and beyond. This omission would also appear to be a violation of GEPA.

To address this issue, we request that the Department take the following actions:

- Compile all states' information submitted via the Significant Disproportionality Reporting Form and post on the IDEA website, and
- Instruct states to post the Significant Disproportionality Reporting Form on the SEA website.

2. EFFECTIVE DATE FOR STATES TO USE NEW STANDARD METHODOLOGY FOR LEA IDENTIFICATION

The 2017 Q+A (<u>https://sites.ed.gov/idea/idea-files/significant-disproportionality-equity-in-idea-essential-questions-and-answers-and-a-model-state-timeline/</u>) stated: "States must implement the standard methodology in SY 2018–19 and identify LEAs with significant disproportionality in SY 2018–19." To our knowledge, the Department has not provided any updated information regarding when states must begin using the new standard methodology for LEA determination.

Yet the reporting on LEAs found to have significant disproportionality in the 2018-2019 SY (See Appendix B) reflects a decline in the number of LEAs identified. Specifically, 427 LEAs were identified in 2017-2018 while 391 LEAs were identified in 2018-2019, representing less than three percent of all LEAs. In fact, less than half of all states identified at least one LEA in 2018-2019. In a report released in March 2021, data analysis conducted by the UCLA Civil Rights Project shows that 181 districts indicate disproportionality is occurring for discipline of students with disabilities, but 28 states flagged none of these districts for that purpose.ⁱⁱ

To address this issue, we request that the Department respond to the following:

- Clarify the date states were required to use the new standard methodology.
- Clarify the Department's process and timeline to monitor implementation of the new methodology.

3. STATUS OF PROPOSED SIGNIFICANT DISPROPORTIONALITY STATE SURVEY

In May 2019, the Department announced its intention to conduct a "Significant Disproportionality State Survey." According to the announcement, the "Department will use this information to support States and LEAs in their efforts to comply with the statutory requirement at section 618(d) of the IDEA." COPAA and many other disability organizations submitted comments *objecting to this proposed survey* for a host of reasons.ⁱⁱⁱ

We request that the Department respond to the following:

- Clarify the status of the proposed state survey.
- Provide information regarding the technical assistance being provided to states to assist in implementation of the new standard methodology.

We appreciate your response to our inquiry and look forward to your response.

Sincerely,

^{(b)(6)} Denise Marshall CEO

cc: David Cantrell, Acting Assistant Secretary, Office of Special Education and Rehabilitative Services/Acting Director, Office of Special Education

The Council of Parent Attorneys and Advocates (COPAA) is an independent, nonprofit organization of parents, attorneys, advocates, and related professionals; over 90% of whom identify as having a disability; or are parents or family members of individuals with disabilities. COPAA's mission is to serve as a national voice for special education rights and is grounded in the belief that every child deserves the right to a quality education that prepares them for meaningful employment, higher education, and lifelong learning, as well as full participation in their community.

ⁱ COPAA v. Elizabeth DeVos, Secretary of Education; Johnny Collet, Assistance Secretary for Special Education and Rehabilitative Services; U.S. Department of Education at: <u>https://ecf.dcd.uscourts.gov/cgi-bin/show_public_doc?2018cv1636-31</u> ⁱⁱ D. Losen, P. Martinez et. al., *Disabling Inequity: The Urgent Need for Race-Conscious Resource Remedies*, (2021) UCLA Civil Rights Project, at: <u>https://www.civilrightsproject.ucla.edu/research/k-12-education/special-education/disabling-inequity-theurgent-need-for-race-conscious-resource-remedies</u>

iii See: Letters RE: ED-2019-ICCD-0065, dated December 27, 2019 and July 12, 2019 respectively

From:	Catoe, Tracy on behalf of Cardona, Miguel
To:	"Laura Kaloi"
Subject:	FW: COPAA letter re: implementation of Equity in IDEA regulations/significant disproportionality
Date:	Monday, May 17, 2021 11:52:00 AM
Attachments:	COPAA ltr to ED re Sig Dis issues.pdf

Dear Ms. Kaloi -

Thank you for your e-mail to Secretary of Education Miguel Cardona. We appreciate hearing from you. Your communication has been forwarded to the appropriate staff member for review. Thank you again for contacting us. Sincerely, T. Tracy Catoe (Ms.) Director of Correspondence Office of the Secretary Washington, DC 20202

From: Laura Kaloi <lkaloi@stridepolicy.com>
Sent: Thursday, May 13, 2021 12:55 PM
To: Cardona, Miguel <Miguel.Cardona@ed.gov>; Sargrad, Scott <Scott.Sargrad@ed.gov>
Cc: Cantrell, David <David.Cantrell@ed.gov>
Subject: COPAA letter re: implementation of Equity in IDEA regulations/significant disproportionality

Good afternoon,

The Council of Parent Attorneys and Advocates (COPAA) is writing Secretary Cardona to request detailed information regarding the implementation of the Equity in IDEA regulations.

COPAA's CEO Denise Marshall would like to meet to discuss the issues raised in the attached letter. She is available May 19th: 11am-2pm ET, or May 21: 10am-3pmET. If we need to find an alternate date/time, that can also be accommodated.

Thank you for considering this request.

Sincerely,

Laura Kaloi COPAA policy advisor

Laura W. Kaloi Partner